

Electronically Filed  
Supreme Court  
SCWC-30701  
31-JAN-2014  
10:15 AM

SCWC-30701

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF HAWAII

---

STATE OF HAWAII, Respondent/Plaintiff-Appellee,

vs.

BRANDY IWALANI C. AVILLA, Petitioner/Defendant-Appellant.

---

CERTIORARI TO THE INTERMEDIATE COURT OF APPEALS  
(ICA NO. 30701; CASE NO. 1DTA-10-00518)

DISSENTING OPINION BY RECKTENWALD, C.J.,  
IN WHICH NAKAYAMA, J., JOINS

For the reasons set forth in my dissenting opinion in State v. Apollonio, 130 Hawai'i 353, 364-371, 311 P.3d 676, 687-694, I respectfully dissent from the majority's conclusion that the lack of a mens rea allegation in the charge requires that the case be dismissed without prejudice despite the defendant's untimely objection to the sufficiency of the charge. In my view, where a defendant does not object to a deficient charge in the trial court, the defendant is required to show how he or she was

prejudiced by the error. In the instant case, the defendant has not demonstrated how she was prejudiced by the deficient charge. Accordingly, I respectfully dissent.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, January 31, 2014.

/s/ Mark E. Recktenwald

/s/ Paula A. Nakayama

