

Electronically Filed
Supreme Court
SCWC-29655
15-JAN-2014
10:00 AM

SCWC-29655

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF HAWAII

STATE OF HAWAII, Respondent/Plaintiff-Appellee,

vs.

FRANCIS M. SHYANGUYA, Petitioner/Defendant-Appellant.

CERTIORARI TO THE INTERMEDIATE COURT OF APPEALS
(ICA NO. 29655; HPD CR. NO. 08347776; CR. NO. 1P108-12324)

DISSENTING OPINION BY RECKTENWALD, C.J.
IN WHICH NAKAYAMA, J. JOINS

For the reasons set forth in my dissenting opinion in State v. Apollonio, 130 Hawai'i 353, 364-371, 311 P.3d 676, 687-694, I respectfully dissent from the majority's conclusion that the lack of a mens rea allegation in the charge requires that the case be dismissed without prejudice despite the defendant's untimely objection to the sufficiency of the charge. In my view, where a defendant does not object to a deficient charge in the

trial court, the defendant is required to show how he or she was prejudiced by the error. In the instant case, the defendant has not demonstrated how he was prejudiced by the deficient charge. Accordingly, I respectfully dissent.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, January 15, 2014.

/s/ Mark E. Recktenwald

/s/ Paula A. Nakayama

