Electronically Filed Supreme Court SCWC-29491 08-OCT-2012 02:12 PM

NO. SCWC-29491

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

CIVIL NO. 05-1-0947

LON WILLIAMS, Individually and as Personal Representative of the ESTATE OF ALACIA WILLIAMS, Deceased, Petitioner/Plaintiff-Appellant, vs. MARC HENDERSON and STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees, and LORRIE ANN MONIZ and CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Defendants, and STATE OF HAWAI'I, Defendant/Third-Party Plaintiff-Appellee, vs. KARIN R. WILLIAMS; CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU; and GIRL SCOUT COUNCIL OF HAWAI'I, Third-Party Defendants-Appellees.

CIVIL NO. 05-1-0846

ALAN GOTO, Individually and as Personal Representative of the ESTATE OF RYAN GOTO, Deceased; DAVID BEGA; and PAUL JAVIER, Petitioners/Plaintiffs-Appellants, VS. MARC HENDERSON; KARIN R. WILLIAMS; GIRL SCOUT COUNCIL OF HAWAI'I; STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees, and LORRIE ANN MONIZ, Defendant, and STATE OF HAWAI'I, Third-Party Plaintiff-Appellee, VS. CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Third-Party Defendant-Appellee. CIVIL NO. 05-1-1045 KARIN WILLIAMS, Petitioner/Plaintiff-Appellant, vs. MARC HENDERSON; STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees, and LORRIE ANN MONIZ, Defendant, and STATE OF HAWAI'I, Third-Party Plaintiff-Appellee, vs. CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Third-Party Defendant-Appellee.

CIVIL NO. 05-1-0883

GEORGIE-ANN GOTO, Individually and as Guardian of the Property of BOWEN GOTO, a minor, Petitioner/Plaintiff-Appellant, vs. MARC HENDERSON; KARIN R. WILLIAMS; GIRL SCOUT COUNCIL OF HAWAI'I; STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees, and STATE OF HAWAI'I, Cross-Plaintiff, vs. CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Cross-Defendant.

> CERTIORARI TO THE INTERMEDIATE COURT OF APPEALS (ICA NO. 29491; CIV. NOS. 05-1-0947, 05-1-0846, 05-1-1045 and 05-1-0883)

ORDER REJECTING APPLICATION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI (By: Nakayama, Acoba, and Pollack, JJ., and Circuit Judge Castagnetti, in place of McKenna, J., recused, with Recktenwald, C.J., dissenting)

The Application for Writ of Certiorari filed on August

24, 2012 by Petitioners/Plaintiffs-Appellants Alan Goto;

Individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Ryan

Goto, Deceased; David Bega; Paul Javier; Lon Williams,

Individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of

Alacia Williams; Karin Williams, and Georgie-Ann Goto,

Individually and as Guardian of the Property of Bowen Goto is hereby rejected.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaiʻi, October 8, 2012.

James J. Bickerton, for petitioners Alan Goto, David Bega, and Paul Javier

James T. Leavitt, Jr., for petitioner Georgie-Ann Goto

Charles J. Ferrera, for petitioner Karin Williams

- /s/ Paula A. Nakayama
- /s/ Simeon R. Acoba, Jr.
- /s/ Richard W. Pollack
- /s/ Jeannette H. Castagnetti



Robin M. Kishi and Caron M. Inagaki, for respondent State of Hawaiʻi

DISSENT BY RECKTENWALD, C.J.

I respectfully dissent. For the reasons articulated in Chief Judge Nakamura's dissenting opinion in <u>Williams v.</u> <u>Henderson</u>, No. 29491, 2012 WL 1951389 (App. May 31, 2012) (SDO), I would grant the petitioners' application.

/s/ Mark E. Recktenwald